

Earl Miner, ed. Princeton Companion to Classical
Japanese Literature (Princeton University Press, 1985)
pp. 248-250

TORIKAE BAYA MONOGATARI とりかえばや
物語 (The Changelings). Late Heian *tsukuri-*
monogatari, *giko monogatari*. Authorship unknown.
In three parts. The **Mumyōzōshi* discusses two ver-
sions, one now generally referred to as the old, *Ko*
Torikaebaya, and the other as the new or present,
Ima Torikaebaya. In the view of the *Mumyōzōshi*,
there are few things to praise and much to object to
in the old version, but much to praise and little to
criticize in the new. Given the improvement effected
by the revision, or imitation, few argue that the
extant version derives from the old. The major
theories hold that the extant version is an amalga-
mation of the old and the new; that it descends in a
textual line from the new; or is yet another stage
after the old and the new. Since both those versions
are lost, evidence turns on comparison of what the
Mumyōzōshi says with the extant version, and of
poems in the present version with those said to be
from the work and included in the **Fūyōshū*. The
evidence is sufficient only for speculation, as is also
true for evidence on authorship and on the sex of the
author. It was probably written between 1115 and
1170, given the works it seems to echo and the works
echoing it.

In many respects the work is a standard Heian
monogatari. The scene is laid in the court and its
environs, the characters are of the nobility, and
much is made of amorous involvements and rise in
court ranks. Above all, we move from an initial situ-
ation through increasing complications to a happy
ending. The story's initial conception, and a source
of some notoriety, is the exchange of sexual roles by
a daughter and a son—extraordinarily like each
other and handsome in looks—born at much the
same time to different wives of the same man. When
the girl begins to behave like a boy (including partic-

icipating in outdoor sport) and the boy like a girl (including playing with dolls), the father utters the wish that gives the monogatari its (Japanese) title: "If Only They Could Be Exchanged." The change is effected by narrator fiat, when, at one point, she (to express a guess as to the narrator's sex) says she will follow the world's error and speak of the girl as the son and the boy as the daughter. She then leaps ahead in time to a point at which court titles will indicate the pretended sex of each of the pair: The "son" becomes a Middle Counsellor (Chūnagon—the standard beginning rank of a hero since the **Sugoromo Monogatari*), the "daughter" a Lady in Waiting (Naishi no Kami) to the Crown Princess. At the age of sixteen, we are told, the Counsellor marries the Fourth Daughter, aged nineteen, of the Minister of Rites. This strange situation can remain stable only as long as the "son" does not come sexually to life, as long as the Fourth Daughter does not object to an unconsummated marriage, and as long as no one else enters the picture. Of course the point is that the story should not remain stable.

Things begin with a certain Saishō Chūjō's seduction of the Fourth Daughter, discovering to his surprise that the wife of his acquaintance, Chūnagon, was a virgin. Meanwhile, the Counsellor has gained the acquaintance of the priestly and learned Third Prince—who had been to China, had married there, had been widowed, had brought his two daughters to Japan (it was a rare favor for women to be allowed ocean passage), and who had retired to Yoshino when factions at court misrepresented him. This Yoshino situation manages to combine elements of *Murasaki Shikibu's *Genji Monogatari* (the Uji section tells of a priestly prince with daughters at Uji) and of *Sugawara Takasue no Musume's *Hamamatsu Chūnagon Monogatari* (developing from the same portion of the *Genji* a transfer from Uji to Yoshino, a voyage to China and back with a child or children). The Counsellor becomes friends with the Prince's two daughters, and "he" suffers enough from uneasiness about "his" personal identity so as to consider closely the standard Heian solution to life's problems, taking orders. One of the debated episodes in the story then occurs when the Third Prince prophesies (he has learned the Counsellor is a woman) that "he" is destined for great things and so should go back into the world. The seemingly irreligious advice from a character idealized for piety has seemed contradictory to many critics. It appears to be partly a vestige of a magic, prophetic mirror in the old version and even more a recollection of a prophetic dream by Sagoromo's father in the fourth part of the **Sugoromo Monogatari*.

Meanwhile, Saishō Chūjō has been visiting the Fourth Daughter frequently in her "husband's" absence, with the result that she has become pregnant. On hearing the news, the father of the exchanged children (who knows nothing of the Chūjō) reflects

with astonishment on "this very odd and unanticipated" development. There are a number of these delightful comic touches. Some are reprises of the *Genji*. For example, the Counsellor (the "son") visits the Third Prince's daughters, chats, and then marches behind the screen of the elder sister with an enterprise typical of *Genji*—although by her being in fact a woman the brisk act has no result. Or, Chūjō spends the night beside the Lady in Waiting, like Kaoru not consummating love with an Ōigimi figure. The Lady is, of course, male, a fact unknown to him.

The plot enters a new phase when on a warm evening Chūjō visits the house of the Counsellor and the Fourth Daughter. Naturally he must call on the "husband" rather than the wife (This replays the scene by The Lady in Waiting). The light clothes of the Counsellor suggest her real sex, and her beauty leads Chūjō to make advances that end in consummation. Before long the Counsellor is pregnant. Chūjō wishes "him" to become a woman and his wife, with the Fourth Daughter as second wife. Questions have been raised about Chūjō's morality. Obviously the more seriously we consider the story the more we must consider his responsibility. One reply is that *Genji* and *Sagoromo* are in fact more amorous. But perhaps the best answer is that Chūjō's ambitions not only further the issues of the transferred sexual roles but also forecast the future triumphs of the male Lady in Waiting.

The first part ends with the pregnant Counsellor continuing "his" duties at court, including a heartfelt imagined last musical performance that draws the artistic and, it seems, erotic attentions of the tennō—and earns a promotion. We learn early in Part Two that this "hero" has turned nineteen. Clearly the first third of the story concentrates on the daughter playing a man's role.

Attention shifts to the Lady in Waiting when "her" supposed brother disappears: "he" has gone to Uji to lie in. "She" resolves to disguise "herself" as a man and seek out "her" "brother." Since "he" has been so fond of Yoshino, "she" thinks of looking for "him" there. In the hot weather, the disguised Lady in Waiting, who may now be designated "he," catches a glimpse of "'his'" beautiful sister and is seen by "him," but "'he'" leaves without a full encounter. Attention shifts to Uji long enough for the "brother" to bear a son and then returns to the "sister."

In a prophetic dream (another recollection of the *Hamamatsu*), the father of the role-exchanged children learns they will "change" to the social roles identified with their biological sexes. In this second stage of the story, the work brings to its height the dream and reality (*yume*, *utsutsu*) emphases of the work. When the two children meet, the "brother" teaches the "sister" socially considered male activities. At one point the two grow quite confused as to who is she and who he, and there are points when

0 PART THREE MAJOR AUTHORS, WORKS

the reader is equally at sea—which is obviously part of the fun and theme. But the change is made, and the children are reconciled with their overjoyed father.

Part Three involves working out the important change in terms of the relations of the sister and brother to other characters in the story. When the real sister takes up the position of Lady in Waiting it turns out that before leaving to search for his "brother," disguising himself as a man, the male Lady in Waiting had got the Princess pregnant, as he shortly does the astonished Fourth Daughter as well. The brother's plot is gradually resolved in good monogatari fashion. He acquires the Princess, the elder Yoshino Princess, and the Fourth Daughter as wives, whom he installs in a new mansion, recalling Genji's Rokujō Palace via Hamamatsu's mansion. By the end of the story, he is Minister of the Left and regent for the new, young tennō, a role not unlike Genji's. This series of events is interwoven with the story of the sister and other characters. The reigning tennō has always liked the looks of the Lady in Waiting to his daughter (even when "she" was the male look-alike) and at last beds her, perplexing himself only in discovering that she is not a virgin. This gives him pause and the story suspense. Will he reject her or love her all the same? It takes time, but she ends as royal Consort, so fulfilling the prophecy of the Yoshino Prince. The former Chūjō, now well advanced in rank, is married off to the younger Yoshino princess by our now openly male hero, but the new husband is denied information of the whereabouts of his former "male" friend the Counsellor, now royal Consort.

This monogatari manages its difficult plot very adroitly, although its greatest technical success comes from keeping credible (and very interesting) what is obviously unbelievable in realistic terms. The occasional comedy and the uncertainty of dream or reality in the middle of the work testify to an assured control of the action and of the milieu of the story. Little matters are handled with an attention to which the author of *Hamamatsu* is sometimes maddeningly indifferent: rank and changes in it, clothes, weather important to those experiencing it, pregnancy that seems real with morning sickness, virginity or its absence.

Comparing it with its three great predecessors on their grounds would lead to the conclusion that it is a little *Genji*, a little **Sagoromo Monogatari*, a little **Hamamatsu*. Its plot is more like that of *Sagoromo* than those of the other two, particularly in outcome. One looks in vain for the Buddhist language of *Sagoromo* and the Buddhist themes so pervasively implicit in the *Genji* and explicit in the *Hamamatsu*. In a way not to the good, *Torikaebaya* secularizes its predecessors.

Yet if we inquire into the work on its own, or in modern terms, we see that its basic conception is more than a device for an erotic, suspenseful plot. It

also raises questions as to just what maleness and, more particularly, what femaleness is. It seems unlikely that any other than the Heian period in a traditional literature could raise the issue of the basic nature of human sexuality as a determinant of personality. Certainly it and related issues are dealt with more profoundly than by Shakespeare or Ben Jonson, who had boy actors play women disguised as men. The fullness with which the psyche of the female Chūnagon is explored implies to us that the author of the present version was either a woman or a man with uncanny insight into women's hearts. The sister's life receives more attention than the brother's, although he and the Chūjō are fully treated and characterized. The work suggests that there must have been men and women at the time who wondered what it was like to be of the other sex, and perhaps even some who would have liked a try at change. The work goes no small distance in showing how society defines maleness or femaleness on bases termed sexual but actually social. If the old question of what is due to nature and what to nurture can never be answered, it can be explored, as this work does with brilliance, aplomb, and a twinkling-eyed narrator. Only a country whose greatest writer is a woman could have produced this lesser but still impressive monogatari so many centuries ago.